

United States Court of Appeals  
For the Eighth Circuit

FILED

NOV 05 2021

MICHAEL GANS  
CLERK OF COURT

STATE OF MISSOURI, )  
STATE OF ARIZONA, )  
STATE OF NEBRASKA, )  
STATE OF MONTANA, )  
STATE OF ARKANSAS, )  
STATE OF IOWA, )  
STATE OF NORTH DAKOTA, )  
STATE OF SOUTH DAKOTA, )  
STATE OF ALASKA, )  
STATE OF NEW HAMPSHIRE, )  
STATE OF WYOMING, )  
AAI, INC., )  
DOOLITTLE TRAILER MFG., INC., )  
CHRISTIAN EMPLOYERS )  
ALLIANCE, )  
SIOUX FALLS CATHOLIC )  
SCHOOLS D/B/A BISHOP )  
O'GORMAN CATHOLIC SCHOOLS, )  
HOME SCHOOL LEGAL DEFENSE )  
ASSOCIATION, INC., )

21-3494

Case No. \_\_\_\_\_

*Petitioners,*

v.

JOSEPH R. BIDEN, JR., )  
in his official capacity as )  
President of the United States )  
of America, )

THE UNITED STATES OF )  
AMERICA, )

DOUGLAS PARKER, )

RECEIVED

NOV 05 2021

U.S. COURT OF APPEALS  
EIGHTH CIRCUIT

Assistant Secretary of Labor )  
for Occupational Safety and )  
Health, )  
)  
OCCUPATIONAL SAFETY AND )  
HEALTH ADMINISTRATION, )  
)  
MARTIN J. WALSH, )  
Secretary of Labor, )  
)  
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF )  
LABOR, )  
)  
Respondents. )

**PETITION FOR REVIEW**

Pursuant to Rule 15 of the Federal Rules of Appellate Procedure and 29 U.S.C. § 655(f), the States of Missouri, Arizona, Nebraska, Montana, Arkansas, Iowa, North Dakota, South Dakota, Alaska, New Hampshire, and Wyoming; and AAI, Inc., Doolittle Trailer Manufacturing, Inc., Christian Employers Alliance, Sioux Falls Catholic Schools d/b/a Bishop O’Gorman Catholic Schools, and Home School Legal Defense Association, Inc., hereby petition the Court for review of the Emergency Temporary Standard (ETS) issued by the Occupational Safety and Health Administration of the U.S. Department of Labor, titled: “COVID-19 Vaccination and Testing; Emergency Temporary Standard.” That ETS was issued by OSHA on November 5,

2021, and is published in the Federal Register at 86 Fed. Reg. 61,402. A copy of the Emergency Temporary Standard is attached as Attachment A.

The Court has jurisdiction and is a proper venue for this action pursuant to 29 U.S.C. § 655(f). This Petition is timely filed as it is filed within 60 days of the November 5, 2021 publication date.

For over a century, the U.S. Supreme Court has recognized that policies on compulsory vaccination lie within the police powers of the States, and that “[t]hey are matters that do not ordinarily concern the national government.” *Jacobson v. Massachusetts*, 197 U.S. 11, 38 (1905). Until quite recently, the Biden Administration agreed. The White House stated on July 23 of this year that mandating vaccines is “not the role of the federal government.” But on September 9, 2021, that position underwent a dramatic reversal. The President announced several sweeping vaccine mandates, including a vaccine mandate to be issued by OSHA that would apply to all employers who employ more than 100 employees. OSHA published this “emergency” mandate two months later, crafting an elaborate *post hoc* justification for a policy that the President had already ordered it to impose. This sweeping

federal mandate encompasses, in OSHA's own estimation, "two-thirds of all private-sector workers in the nation."

This mandate is unconstitutional, unlawful, and unwise. The federal government lacks constitutional authority under its enumerated powers to issue this mandate, and its attempt to do so unconstitutionally infringes on the States' powers expressly reserved by the Tenth Amendment. OSHA also lacks statutory authority to issue the ETS, which it shoe-horned into statutes that govern workplace safety, and which were never intended to federalize public-health policy. OSHA's justification for the mandate is not supported by substantial evidence in the record considered as a whole under 29 U.S.C. § 655(f), as the ETS fails to consider obvious distinctions and critical aspects of the problem. Its unlawful mandate will cause injuries and hardship to working families, inflict economic disruption and staffing shortages on the States and private employers, and impose even greater strains on struggling labor markets and supply chains.

OSHA's justification for this unprecedented mandate constitutes the quintessential "*post hoc* rationalization[]" that "cannot be accepted as a basis for review." *Asbestos Info. Ass'n/N. Am. v. Occupational*

*Safety & Health Admin.*, 727 F.2d 415, 422 (5th Cir. 1984). OSHA did not first discern a “grave danger” to employees and then devise a standard “necessary” to protect them, as the statute requires. 29 U.S.C. § 655(c). Instead, the President dictated his preferred policy to the agency in advance, and OSHA reverse-engineered a justification for that predetermined conclusion. It is a “foundational principle of administrative law” to reject such “impermissible *post hoc* rationalizations.” *Dep’t of Homeland Sec. v. Regents of the Univ. of California*, 140 S. Ct. 1891, 1907, 1909 (2020). The Court should do so.

For these and many other reasons, Petitioners respectfully request that this Court hold unlawful, vacate, and set aside the Order, grant a stay of the Order pending judicial review, and grant such further relief as may be deemed just and proper.

Date: November 5, 2021

Respectfully submitted,

**ERIC S. SCHMITT**  
Attorney General of Missouri

/s/ D. John Sauer

D. John Sauer, #58721MO

*Solicitor General*

Jesus A. Osete

Michael E. Talent

Office of the Attorney General

Supreme Court Building

207 W. High St.

P.O. Box 899

Jefferson City, MO 65102

Tel. (573) 751-8870

Fax (573) 751-0774

John.Sauer@ago.mo.gov

*Counsel for Petitioners*

Additional Counsel:

**MARK BRNOVICH**

Arizona Attorney General

/s/ Drew C. Ensign

Drew Ensign

Deputy Solicitor General

Arizona Attorney General's Office

2005 N. Central Ave.

Phoenix, AZ 85004

(602) 542-3333

Drew.ensign@azag.gov

*Counsel for State of Arizona*

**AUSTIN KNUDSEN**

*Attorney General of Montana*

**KRISTIN HANSEN**

*Lieutenant General*

*/s/ David M.S. Dewhirst*

**DAVID M.S. DEWHIRST**

*Solicitor General*

**CHRISTIAN B. CORRIGAN**

*Assistant Solicitor General*

Office of the Attorney General

215 North Sanders

P.O. Box 201401

Helena, MT 59620-1401

406-444-2026

David.Dewhirst@mt.gov

Christian.Corrigan@mt.gov

*Counsel for State of Montana*

**DOUGLAS J. PETERSON**

*Attorney General of Nebraska*

*/s/ James A. Campbell*

James A. Campbell

*Solicitor General*

Office of the Nebraska Attorney General

2115 State Capitol

Lincoln, Nebraska 68509

(402) 471-2682

jim.campbell@nebraska.gov

*Counsel for State of Nebraska*

**LESLIE RUTLEDGE**

Arkansas Attorney General

/s/ Nicholas J. Bronni

Nicholas J. Bronni

Solicitor General

Vincent M. Wagner

Deputy Solicitor General

Office of the Arkansas Attorney General

323 Center Street, Suite 200

Little Rock, Arkansas 72201

(501) 682-8090

Nicholas.bronni@arkansasag.gov

*Counsel for State of Arkansas*

**JEFFREY S. THOMPSON**

Solicitor General

/s/ Samuel P. Langholz

SAMUEL P. LANGHOLZ

Assistant Solicitor General

Office of the Iowa Attorney General

1305 E. Walnut Street

Des Moines, Iowa 50319

(515) 281-5164

jeffrey.thompson@ag.iowa.gov

sam.langholz@ag.iowa.gov

*Counsel for State of Iowa*

**WAYNE STENEHJEM**

Attorney General of North Dakota

/s/ Matthew A. Sagsveen

Matthew A. Sagsveen

Solicitor General

State Bar ID No. 05613

Office of Attorney General

500 North 9th Street

Bismarck, ND 58501-4509

Telephone (701) 328-3640

Facsimile (701) 328-4300

masagsve@nd.gov

**JASON R. RAVNSBORG**

South Dakota Attorney General

/s/ David M. McVey

David M. McVey

Assistant Attorney General

1302 E. Highway 14, Suite 1

Pierre, SD 57501-8501

Phone: 605-773-3215

E-Mail: david.mcvey@state.sd.us

*Counsel for State of South Dakota*

**TREG R. TAYLOR**

Attorney General of Alaska

/s/ Charles E. Brasington

Charles E. Brasington

Assistant Attorney General

State of Alaska

1031 West Fourth Avenue, Suite 200

Anchorage, AK 99501

(907) 269-6612

charles.brasington@alaska.gov

*Counsel for State of Alaska*

**JOHN M. FORMELLA**

New Hampshire Attorney General

/s/ Anthony J. Galdieri

Anthony J. Galdieri

Solicitor General

Counsel of Record

NEW HAMPSHIRE DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

33 Capitol Street

Concord, NH 03301

Tel: (603) 271-3658

Anthony.J.Galdieri@doj.nh.gov

*Counsel for State of New Hampshire*

**BRIDGET HILL**

Wyoming Attorney General

/s/ Ryan Schelhaas

Ryan Schelhaas

Chief Deputy Attorney General

Wyoming Attorney General's Office

109 State Capitol

Cheyenne, WY 82002

Telephone: (307) 777-5786

ryan.schelhaas@wyo.gov

*Attorneys for the State of Wyoming*

**AAI, Inc.**

/s/ Jefferson Downing

Jefferson Downing

Keating, O'Gara, Nedved & Peter, PC, LLO

P.O. Box 82248

Lincoln, Nebraska 68501

(402) 475-8230

jd@keatinglaw.com

*Counsel for AAI, Inc.*

**Doolittle Trailer Manufacturing, Inc.**

/s/ Matthew W. Murphy

Matthew W. Murphy, MO47786  
Vessell Bridges Murphy Law Offices  
3901 S. Providence Road, Suite D  
Columbia, Missouri 65203  
(573) 777-4488  
matt@vbmlaw.com  
*Counsel for Doolittle Trailer Mfg., Inc.*

**Christian Employers Alliance**

**Sioux Falls Catholic Schools d/b/a Bishop O’Gorman Catholic  
Schools**

**Home School Legal Defense Association, Inc.**

/s/ Ryan L. Bangert

David A. Cortman  
John J. Bursch\*  
Ryan L. Bangert\*  
Matthew S. Bowman  
440 First Street, NW, Suite 600  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Telephone: (202) 393-8690  
Facsimile: (202) 347-3622  
dcortman@adflegal.org  
jbursch@adflegal.org  
rbangert@adflegal.org  
mbowman@adflegal.org

\*admitted to Eighth Circuit; not licensed in D.C.

*Counsel for Christian Employers Alliance, Sioux Falls Catholic Schools  
d/b/a Bishop O’Gorman Catholic Schools, and Home School Legal  
Defense Association, Inc.*

### Certificate of Compliance

The undersigned hereby certifies that this motion complies with the typeface and formatting requirements of Fed. R. App. P. 27 and 32, and that it contains 602 words as determined by the word-count feature of Microsoft Word.

/s/ D. John Sauer

### Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that on November 5, 2021, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court for the United States Court of Appeals for the Eighth Circuit by using the CM/ECF system. Participants in the case who are registered CM/ECF users will be served by the CM/ECF system.

I further certify that I will serve, by electronic mail, one date-stamped copy of the foregoing on each of the following parties at the following e-mail addresses:

1. Martin J. Walsh, Secretary of Labor  
c/o Edmund C. Baird  
Associate Solicitor for Occupational Safety and Health  
Office of the Solicitor  
U.S. Department of Labor  
[zzSOL-Covid19-ETS@dol.gov](mailto:zzSOL-Covid19-ETS@dol.gov)

2. United States Department of Labor  
c/o Edmund C. Baird  
Associate Solicitor for Occupational Safety and Health  
Office of the Solicitor  
U.S. Department of Labor  
[zzSOL-Covid19-ETS@dol.gov](mailto:zzSOL-Covid19-ETS@dol.gov)
  
3. Douglas Parker  
Assistant Secretary of Labor for Occupational Safety and Health  
c/o Edmund C. Baird  
Associate Solicitor for Occupational Safety and Health  
Office of the Solicitor  
U.S. Department of Labor  
[zzSOL-Covid19-ETS@dol.gov](mailto:zzSOL-Covid19-ETS@dol.gov)
  
4. Occupational Safety and Health Administration  
c/o Edmund C. Baird  
Associate Solicitor for Occupational Safety and Health  
Office of the Solicitor  
U.S. Department of Labor  
[zzSOL-Covid19-ETS@dol.gov](mailto:zzSOL-Covid19-ETS@dol.gov)

I also certify that I will serve, via U.S. Postal Service Certified Mail, one paper copy of the foregoing on each party at the following addresses:

1. Joseph R. Biden, Jr., President of the United States of America  
c/o Attorney General of the United States  
U.S. Department of Justice  
950 Pennsylvania Avenue NW  
Washington, D.C. 20530
  
2. The United States of America  
c/o Attorney General of the United States  
U.S. Department of Justice  
950 Pennsylvania Avenue NW

Washington, D.C. 20530

3. Martin J. Walsh, Secretary of Labor  
Office of the Solicitor  
U.S. Department of Labor  
200 Constitution Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20210
4. United States Department of Labor  
Office of the Solicitor  
U.S. Department of Labor  
200 Constitution Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20210
5. Douglas Parker  
Assistant Secretary of Labor for Occupational Safety and Health  
Office of the Solicitor  
U.S. Department of Labor  
200 Constitution Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20210
6. Occupational Safety and Health Administration  
Office of the Solicitor  
U.S. Department of Labor  
200 Constitution Ave NW  
Washington, DC 20210

*/s/ D. John Sauer*  
Solicitor General of Missouri

*Counsel for Petitioners*